

ಕರ್ನಾಟಕ ಸರ್ಕಾರ  
GOVERNMENT OF KARNATAKA

ಪ್ರಧಾನ ಮುಖ್ಯ ಅರಣ್ಯ ಸಂರಕ್ಷಣಾಧಿಕಾರಿ  
(ಅರಣ್ಯಪಡೆ ಮುಖ್ಯಸ್ಥರು) ರವರ ಕಛೇರಿ

Office of  
Principal Chief Conservator of Forests  
(Head of Forest Force)



ಅರಣ್ಯಭವನ, 18ನೇ ಅಡ್ಡರಸ್ತೆ,  
ಮಲ್ಲೇಶ್ವರಂ, ಬೆಂಗಳೂರು-560 003.  
AranyaBhavan, 18th Cross,  
Malleshwaram, Bengaluru-560 003  
Telephone : 080 2334 6472  
Email : apccffc@gmail.com

Old File No. A5(2).GFL.CR-25/2019-20

E-office File No.KFD/HOFF/A5-2(GFL)/176/2019-FC

E-137748

Date 28-03-2023

To,

The Additional Chief Secretary to Government  
Forest, Environment and Ecology Department  
M.S. Building, Bengaluru - 560 001

Sir,

**Sub:** Diversion of 17.49 ha(*revised from 16.246 ha*) of forest land in Haladi-76, Avarshe and Heggunte and other villages in Udupi and Brahmavara Taluk of Udupi District for construction of Irrigation Main and Branch Canals under Varahi Lift Irrigation Scheme in favour of the Executive Engineer, Karnataka Neeravari Nigam Limited, No.2, Varahi Reservoir Project Division, Udupi.

**Proposal No.FP/KA/IRRIG/41736/2019 [FORM A]**

- Ref:**
1. This office letter of even No dated 20-06-2022 [*seeking Stage-I approval*] and 14-12-2022 [*communication of EDS query to Field Officers and User Agency*]
  2. Government of Karnataka letter No FEE 87 FLL 2022 (e) dated 18-07-2022 [*forwarded the proposal to GOI*] and 06-12-2022 [*online link transferred to this office*]
  3. Government of India letter No.4-KRB1366/2022-BAN/69 dated 08-09-2022 and 25-11-2022[*EDS query*]
  4. Executive Engineer, Karnataka Neeravari Nigam Limited (KNNL), No.2, Varahi Reservoir Project Division letter No KNNL/EE.No-2-VRPD/PB/VLC-Forest/2022-23/ dated 14-12-2022 and 13-02-2023[*submission of information to DCF Kundapura Division*]
  5. Deputy Conservator of Forests, Kundapura Division, letter No. DMN/CR.40/FLD/2020-21 dated 28-12-2022 and 22-02-2023 [*submission of information to Chief Conservator of Forests, Mangaluru Circle*]
  6. Chief Conservator of Forests, Mangaluru Circle letter No.A3/CR-27/Varahi Lift Irrigation Scheme/FC/2019-20 dated 31-12-2022 and 23-02-2023 [*reply submitted to this office*]



With reference to the above subject, this office vide Ref (1) has submitted the proposal to Government of Karnataka for seeking '*in-principle*' (Stage-I) approval under Section 2 of Forest (Conservation) Act, 1980. The Government of Karnataka vide Ref (2) letter dated 18-07-2022 has forwarded the proposal to Government of India for seeking stage-I approval.

In response, the Government of India vide Ref (3) has raised EDS query seeking clarification and information on four points. The Government of Karnataka vide Ref (2) letter dated 06-12-2022 was communicated the same.

Accordingly, this office vide Ref (1) letter dated 14-12-2022 has communicated the Government of India EDS query to User Agency and Field officers.

In response, User Agency vide Ref (4) has submitted the information to Deputy Conservator of Forests, Kundapura Division. who, after verification, vide Ref (5) has submitted the same to the Chief Conservator of Forests, Mangaluru Circle and who has, in turn vide Ref (5) has submitted it to this office. Based on the reports obtained from the User Agency and Field officers, the information is as follows.

Government of India to EDS query dated 25-11- 2022	Remarks
1 The justification given by User Agency that by avoiding forest area, there will be reduction in the total command area is not supported by quantitative details.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Alternate-I Canal alignment runs in deep cut reaches creates command area of only 815.66 ha as against the proposed 2723 ha of command area. There will be a reduction of 1907.34 ha in the total command area.</li> <li>• Alternate-II Canal alignment runs in lower contour creates command area of 1386 ha as against the proposed 2723 ha of Command area. There will be reduction of 1337 ha in the total command area. The Maps are enclosed as [ANNEXURE-I]</li> </ul>
2 The cost escalation is cited as a reason for discarding one of the alternative alignments examined in non-forest area. However, the exact details of increase in cost	Alternate-I alignment passing through non-forest land runs very near to State Highway-27 & Major District roads and also runs in deep cut regions which in turn increases the cost of the project and also increase in land acquisition. Also, there will be reduction of 1907.34 ha in the total command area. The Cost escalation details are enclosed as



<p>for setting up the project in non-forest land is not provided. The values of Ecosystem Goods and Services of the forest area selected for the proposed alignment needs to be compared with the implementation cost in non-forest area to arrive at a specific conclusion of discarding or selecting forest/non forest area.</p>	<p><b>[ANNEXURE-II]</b></p> <p>The length of the Canal runs over forest land proposed for diversion under Varahi Lift Irrigation Project is 8.90km covering 17.49ha. The cost of land acquisition including compensation in case of non-Forest land will be about Rs. 60.00crores, if Project has to be implemented in non-Forest area. The cost of timber on felling of 5854 No's of trees coming under present proposed 17.49ha. forest area will be about Rs. 54.11 Lakhs.</p> <p>Further, it is submitted that, in general there are no standard approved methodologies in practice to evaluate monetary value calculations of ecosystem goods and services of the Forest. It is obvious that there will be loss of tangible ecosystem benefits like timber, tree cover, fodder and also there may be loss to other services. But we cannot evaluate these losses in monetary terms and cannot be compared with the project implementation cost. Hence, we have included only the timber value under forest land proposed and also land acquisition and compensation cost under non-Forest land as mentioned above. However, User Agency is paying NPV stipulated by Supreme Court for the damages to ecosystem perceptible and also alternative land has been given to Forest Department for Compensatory Afforestation Purpose.</p> <p>However, since this is an Irrigation Project, allowing of water in to the canals to irrigable command areas will in turn recharge the ground water table, improve the water regime and also improve the livelihood of farmers. These types of benefits will be there for the general ecosystem by implementation of this irrigation project, which cannot be evaluated in terms of monetary values.</p> <p>So, under above circumstances, it may be kindly considered <b>[ANNEXURE-III]</b></p>
<p>In order to assess the</p>	<p>Details of quantifiable assessment of feasible</p>




3	gravity of <i>fait accompli</i> situation created by the User Agency, quantifiable assessment of feasible alternatives may be examined and reported.	alternatives are enclosed as[ANNEXURE-IV]
4	The status of compliance of conditions stipulated with respect to diversion of 15.40 ha of forest land accorded under FC Act, 1980 vide letter No. F(C)A/16.1/KAR/34/IP dated 03-01-1996 and for diversion of 129.60 ha of forest land vide letter No. 8-107/84-FC dated 12-03-2004 duly authenticated by State Forest Department may be approved.	The compliance of conditions is enclosed as[ANNEXURE-V]

In view of the above, it is requested to move the matter with the Government of India, Ministry of Environment, Forests & Climate Change, Integrated Regional Office, Bengaluru to accord 'in principle' approval (Stage-I) under the Forest (Conservation) Act, 1980 for the project.

The relevant documents in 3 sets are submitted here with for kind perusal and further action. The present status of the proposal obtained from the web-portal is also appended for necessary action

Yours faithfully

  
(Vijay Sharma. IFS)

Principal Chief Conservator of Forests  
(Forest Conservation) and Nodal Officer (FCA)

1. Copy to the Chief Conservator of Forests, Mangaluru Circle, Mangaluru for information.
2. Copy to the Deputy Conservator of Forests, Kundapura Division, Kundapura for information.
3. Copy to the Executive Engineer, Karnataka Neeravari Nigam Limited (KNNL), No.2, Varahi Reservoir Project Division, Siddapura, Kundapura, Udupi District for information.